

---

# Awards Judging Procedures

## 2022 ICAD Awards

# ICAD

# Judging

---

<b>Overview</b>	The ICAD Awards are the preeminent annual awards for excellence in Irish advertising and design. For over 63 years, the ICAD bell has been internationally recognised as a symbol of creative achievement. To select work worthy of the award, each year we assemble juries of the finest creatives in Ireland, supported by carefully selected international jurors.								
<b>Juries</b>	There are four jury panels: Graphic Design; Advertising Film and Radio; Advertising Print, Display and Experience; and Production Craft.								
<b>Confidentiality</b>	Judges and jury assistants must agree to maintain strict confidentiality about the results of the judging and all matters relating to the process.								
<b>Criteria</b>	The focus of judging is creative excellence. Except for the Earned Media category, in which the impact of the work is the central criterion, it is not the purpose of ICAD juries to consider how effective entries were in the marketplace.								
<b>Award Levels</b>	<p>Work is judged on three criteria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Is it a good and original idea?</li><li>→ Has that good and original idea been well executed?</li><li>→ Is the work relevant in its context?</li></ul> <table><tr><td><b>Commended</b></td><td>An excellent piece of creative work.</td></tr><tr><td><b>Bronze</b></td><td>One of the finest works of the year in its discipline; an example of the best Irish advertising and design.</td></tr><tr><td><b>Silver</b></td><td>Outstanding work that raises the Irish standard nationally and internationally.</td></tr><tr><td><b>Gold</b></td><td>Exceptional in idea, execution, and quality; memorable work that defines or redefines its field and will help gain renown for Irish creativity internationally.</td></tr></table>	<b>Commended</b>	An excellent piece of creative work.	<b>Bronze</b>	One of the finest works of the year in its discipline; an example of the best Irish advertising and design.	<b>Silver</b>	Outstanding work that raises the Irish standard nationally and internationally.	<b>Gold</b>	Exceptional in idea, execution, and quality; memorable work that defines or redefines its field and will help gain renown for Irish creativity internationally.
<b>Commended</b>	An excellent piece of creative work.								
<b>Bronze</b>	One of the finest works of the year in its discipline; an example of the best Irish advertising and design.								
<b>Silver</b>	Outstanding work that raises the Irish standard nationally and internationally.								
<b>Gold</b>	Exceptional in idea, execution, and quality; memorable work that defines or redefines its field and will help gain renown for Irish creativity internationally.								
<b>Briefing</b>	The full group of jurors will be briefed by the president of ICAD as to the values and goals of the competition. Jurors will be provided insight into judging criteria, and ICAD's expectations as they work through entries. At this stage jurors will also be briefed as to the technical aspects of judging, the judging platform and the associated rules and processes.								
<b>Remote Judging</b>	<p>On Monday April 11th, the various juries will be granted to access the ICAD Awards platform. Each judge will review the work assigned to them in their own time, and vote 'yes' or 'no' for each entry. 'Yes' means you want to commend the work (this will be revisited at the next stage). An entry that gets a 'yes' vote from at least 50% of the panel will be commended until live judging stage 1; all others will be removed permanently from competition. This stage of remote judging will last until 6pm April 18th.</p> <p>Judges are expected not to judge work where there is a conflict of interest. They can simply pass any entry they have worked on/which was created by their current place of work, and leave a comment in the comment box to flag the conflict.</p>								

# Judging

---

## Live Judging Stage 1

Following the remote judging, there will be live judging stage 1. This will happen in person at Windmill Lane, 29 Herbert St, Dublin 2. Exact start times will be confirmed following the initial briefing. Those international jurors who are joining will be facilitated in dialling in. The aim of this call is to work through the entries together, discussing the merits of each entry but *privately*, ranking the entries from 0 — 4. The value for these are as follows:

- 0 — Remove from competition.
- 1 — Remain Commended.
- 2 — Bronze
- 3 — Silver
- 4 — Gold

---

## Live Judging Stage 2

Following stage 1, jurors will be presented with a visual gallery showing work at the award level it has fallen based on its average score achieved in stage 2. The job of the jury at this point will be to work through each entry carefully, assess where it has fallen based on the private ranking, and move entries up or down as is necessary. You will also be asked to award in certain special categories such as the client award, but you will get further information on this at the in person judging.

---

## Rules and Notes

- In the case where there is a conflict of interest for a judge regarding a particular entry, the judge is required to abstain from judging. Further to this they may not contribute to the discussion of the merits or otherwise of the entry during the live judging and are asked to step outside the room in these instances.
- A 'conflict of interest' may be defined as a judge who was a participant in the creation of an entry or an employee in the company that produced the work.
- The ICAD Awards are judged to an overall standard. It is therefore possible to award several projects of the same type in any given category. Likewise, there may also be no awards in a category where the standard of entries does not merit one.
- Entries can be commended or awarded in more than one category if they have been entered in more than one category.
- Where it becomes apparent that an entry did not comply with the terms and conditions or where for some other reason there is any doubt about its originality or credits or any other matter, the matter in question must be brought to the attention of the ICAD Board (the jury can bring concerns to the programme coordinator Jenny Leahy). Reconsideration of the entry and its commendation status is the decision of the ICAD Board, in consultation with the Jury Chairperson and will be final.

# Judging

## Instructions for Remote Judging

→ Log in to <https://icad.awardsplatform.com>

→ Your login information is as follows.

*Username* The email address you received this to.

*Password* ICADAwards2022! (you can feel free to change this once you log on the first time).

→ Once logged in, you will see a section titled 'Judging information,' and underneath, a list of categories.

→ Please review and submit the confidentiality agreement.

→ Navigate to 'Entries' and then 'Qualify Entries.' You will be greeted by a list of tips for judging, followed by the entries you are to judge.

→ When you click into an entry, you will see all the details entered by the entrant on the left side of the page. On the right side, is where you put in your score & comments.

→ If you wish to abstain from judging for any reason, simply skip the entry and note it in the comment box.

→ The Notes box at the bottom of the page is for your personal use only. No one but you can see that.

→ The Comments box can be seen by awards organisers only. If you have confidential comments for discussion with your fellow jurors, we ask that you relay these directly to said jurors.

→ Once you've scored the entry, hit save and you'll be back to the list.

→ You will need to work through a large number of entries. As such you are encouraged to take the time to accurately and fairly assess each entry.

→ Once you have viewed an entry, you have 2 options;  
Yes / No

→ Entries which receive a majority yes vote (3 or more) will progress to the next stage. Those which receive a majority no, will be permanently removed from competition.

→ If you are having trouble loading or accessing any files, or with the system generally, please contact Jenny Leahy. Jenny can be reached at [info@icad.ie](mailto:info@icad.ie) or 0877733079 for assistance.